

El riesgo de incorporar el crecimiento económico y el turismo en la prevención del Covid-19 en Indonesia

The Risk of Mainstreaming Economic Growth and Tourism on Preventing Covid-19 in Indonesia

SURWANDONO

International Relations Department
Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta
surwandono@umy.ac.id

MUHAMMAD DEDY YANUAR

International Relations Department
Universitas Veteran Jawa Timur
muhammad.dedy.hubint@upnjatim.ac.id

Este artículo está sujeto a una: Licencia "Creative Commons Reconocimiento-No Comercial" (CC-BY-NC)

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.24197/st.2.2021.94-114>

RECIBIDO:22/02/2021
ACEPTADO:06/04/2021

Resumen: El brote de Covid-19 ha ejercido una gran presión sobre la gestión de los problemas del turismo internacional e Indonesia, al ser una atracción turística, no es una excepción. En este sentido, el objetivo principal de este estudio fue analizar el dilema de la política de salud de Indonesia para mantener el flujo de visitantes turísticos y contener la propagación de la pandemia Covid-19. En esta investigación se utilizaron métodos de investigación cualitativa. La recopilación de datos se llevó a cabo a través de legislaciones constitucionales, comunicados de prensa del grupo de trabajo especial Covid-19 de Indonesia y observaciones recopiladas de numerosas instalaciones públicas que son utilizadas principalmente por viajeros, como aeropuertos, estaciones de trenes y autobuses. Esta investigación revela que la política que prioriza la seguridad del crecimiento económico y el turismo en el contexto de una pandemia mundial tiende a ser más contraproducente para la gestión de la contención del contagio. También se encontró que la implementación de protocolos de salud y restricciones a las actividades sociales también se afirma como la forma más y eficiente de contener el contagio.

Abstract: The outbreak of Covid-19 has put serious pressure on the management of international tourism problems and Indonesia, being a tourist attraction, is not an exception. In this wake, the main purpose of this study was to analyze the dilemma of Indonesia's health policy in maintaining the stream of tourism visitors as well as containing the spread of the Covid-19 pandemic. Qualitative research methods were used in this research. Data collection was conducted through constitutional legislations, press releases from the Indonesian Covid-19 special task force and observations gathered from numerous public facilities which are mostly used by travellers such as airport, train and bus station. This research reveals that that the policy prioritizing to the safety of economic growth and tourism in the global pandemic context is inclined to be more contra-productive to the management of containing contagion. It was also found that the implementation of health protocols and restrictions on social activities is also claimed to be the most and efficient way to contain the contagion.

Keywords: Mainstreaming tourism; Infectious disease; COVID-19; Indonesia's health policy.

Palabras Clave: Transversalización del turismo; Enfermedad infecciosa; COVID-19; Política de salud de Indonesia.

1. INTRODUCTION

Indonesia has copious tourism resources of which the feature of Indonesian tourism has its own uniqueness in destinations and cordiality in serving visitors. The destination uniqueness is reflected by the variety of attractive tourism objects which inspired poets calling Indonesia as the 'Emerald Equator'. In terms of cordiality, Indonesia poses a high social modality as an Eastern nation who is glorifying various cultures in interacting with its different kinds of societies (Hampton & Clifton, 2016).

The study of international tourism conducted by UNWTO (UNWTO, 2018) in 2017 showed that there were around 10 countries nominated as the most favourite places to visit, as follows: France (86.9 million), Spain (81.8 million), United States of America (75.9 million), China (60.7 million), Italy (58.3 million), Mexico (39.3 million), United Kingdom (37.7 million), Turkey (37.6 million), Germany (37.5 million) and Thailand (35.4 million). Within Southeast Asia region, Indonesia was ranked at 4th position after Thailand, Malaysia, and Singapura (CNN, 2020). A few analysts have argued that the reasons why Indonesian tourism is not yet competitive because of the different reasons such as unavailability of tourism connection that allows international and domestic tourists to do a visit without difficulty and at low cost (for instance, see Webster, 2017).

The connection problem generically constitutes public necessity which should be provided by a state as the main actor. The availability of infrastructure becomes the major factor which enabled the process of heading to the tourism destination easier, such as the construction of airport (Wattanacharoensil et al., 2017), highway, bridge, train station and harbour (Khadaroo & Seetanah, 2007). For instance, the tourism in Israel is making a significant progress with its new airport management by relocating the old airport to be more strategic (Ergas & Felsenstein, 2012). Bangladesh significantly encouraged its tourism objects by building highway construction systematically (Chandra Roy & Roy, 2015), as well as the availability of supra-structure whose regulation enabled the entry process of tourist to a state easier. A study from Cheng (2012) showed that granting visa-free access significantly increased the tourism growth in Hong Kong (Cheng, 2012). Yet Uzama's study (2019) on tourism growth in Japan explained that the increase in the number of

foreign tourist visits and prolongation is strongly influenced by tourist-friendly policies through visa-free policies and a 90-day tourist visa validity period (Uzama, 2009). In Indonesia, President Jokowi responded to the tourism challenge by creating a mega infra-structure program comprising roads, bridges, ports and airports to support Indonesian tourism as mentioned in the Indonesian House of Representatives (MPR) session on August 16th, 2019 (MPR RI, 2019). In the last 5 years, a number of hotmic roads have been built extending to 3,887 kilometres, 782 kilometres of toll roads, 41,063 bridges, 10 international airports throughout Indonesia, 156 kilometres of railways, and 27 sea ports. The construction of the airport had a very significant impact on the flux of tourist visits, as the airport had been functioning as a leading sector impacting towards a number of tourism efficiencies, especially in the prospective travellers' viewpoints. The existence of the airport has always been the main consideration for tourists to visit (Fernández et al., 2018). In addition, Indonesia has also implemented visa-free policies to 21 countries in all over the world. This policy makes Indonesia as one of the easiest and the most accessible countries to visit. The package of infrastructure development and massive superstructure in the tourism sector is expected to play a pivotal role on the contribution of tourism sector even greater, which is about 30% of GDP.

Some of Jokowi's policies were able to change the contribution of tourism in the GDP structure which at first ranged between 3.09% in 2012, elevating and contributing to 4.80% in Indonesia's GDP in 2019 (Maarif, 2019). The tourism sector has become the one that contributes the most in GDP after oil, gas, and palm oil (World Travel & Tourism Council, 2017). Tourism itself has also been utilized as a medium for poverty alleviation in a number of rural areas (Mahadevan et al., 2017) with the introduction to Agro-tourism (agricultural tourism), as well as applied in fishing villages categorized as one of the poorest areas. West and East Nusa Tenggara is the best example of tourism contribution for improving people's well-being. There was a change in the Human development Index from 61.16 in 2012, to 67.30 in 2018 (Sugiyarto et al., 2003).

Indonesia's tourism policy has been implemented progressively. The government of Indonesia uses that particular policy to intervene on airfares, which functions so far as the leading factor of tourism. The competitive airfare will make tourists easier to travel on a number of tours with a longer stay in Indonesia. This such interference needs to be

immediately conducted by the Indonesian government as there was a significant increase in airfares caused by the weakening exchange rate of rupiah over dollar in the period 2019. The data showed that this effort received a positive response from tourists in which the number of tourist visits to Indonesia had increased up to 1.27 million or equivalent to a 3.8% increase (BPSI, 2018).

Another tourism policy which is also vital constitutes Indonesian tourism branding with the so-called Wonderful Indonesia, in which it involved world-class influencers to provide testimonials and endorsements about its uniqueness (Erislan, 2016) as well as its quality of Indonesian tourism services. The study from Hanifah (2019) shows that the role of influencers in the social media line has a positive effect on the number of tourist visits to Indonesia (Hanifah, 2019). The government has provided an enormous budget from 1 Trillion to 7 trillion, and 70% of total is allocated for promotional budgets (CNNIndonesia.com, 2020). The Ministry of Tourism's budget has been recognized as one of the top 5 ministries with the largest budget, following after the Ministry of Defence, Ministry of Infrastructure and Development, Ministry of Health, and Ministry of Education and Culture. The huge budget caused a number of protests from the public. However, the government of Indonesia keeps running this such tourism marketing processes massively, as the number of Indonesian tourist visits has only reached 16 million in contrast with the set target of 20 million in 2019 (BPSI, 2018).

The government's enthusiasm to execute the tourism development program is driven by the successful experience of other third world countries developing tourism as a new sector that can accelerate the economic growth. Having said that, the tourism management has occasionally been disrupted by terrorism incident. Unfortunately, Indonesia is one of the countries that is still infrequently experiencing acts of terrorism. Acts of terrorism implied a bad precedent for the influx of foreign investment to Indonesia. Turkey, Tunisia and Egypt are countries which also experienced resembled terrorism threats. Yet these three countries have succeeded to utilize tourism aspect as the leading sector of economic development in a rapid and robust way (World Travel & Tourism Council, 2017). Based on the experience of the aforementioned countries, the Indonesian government has remained consistent in its policy to compose massive tourism visits (Nizar, 2015).

The Indonesian government has intensively conducted promotions, especially focusing on a few top tourism destinations with the well-known catchphrase 'Wonderful Indonesia'. These destinations are accessible and spread across a number of provinces in Indonesia (The Jakarta Post, 2017). The 11 top tourist destinations that were massively promoted included Lake Toba in North Sumatra, Tanjung Kelayang in Bangka Belitung, Tanjung Lesung in Banten, Thousand Islands in Jakarta, Borobudur Temple in Central Java, Bromo, Tengger and Semeru in East Java, Mandalika in West Nusa Tenggara, Labuan Bajo in East Nusa Tenggara, Wakatobi in Southeast Sulawesi, Morotai in North Maluku, and Tana Toraja in South Sulawesi. However, outbreak of Covid-19 has put serious pressure on the management of international tourism problems. In this wake, the main purpose of this study was to analyse the dilemma of Indonesia's health policy in maintaining the stream of tourism visitors as well as containing the spread of the Covid-19 pandemic. The paper is divided into different sections, the next section on material and methods has elucidated about the research methodology of the paper followed by the sections on findings and discussions. last part has concluded the discussion.

2. MATERIAL AND METHODS

The materials used in this article were official government policy papers and regulations obtained from official government websites related to Covid-19, and tourism policies during the Pandemic as well as news from Indonesian media at the national level, such as Koran Tempo, CNN Indonesia, Sindo News, Detik.com, and journals related to tourism and infectious diseases.

The data processing process uses qualitative methods, in which the data obtained is classified according to the 2 approaches used to analyze the relationship between conservative policy choices in terms of broadly limiting human movement and accommodating in the form of providing space for human movement during a pandemic. The analysis was carried out to determine the impact of conservative and accommodative policies on economic conditions, tourism development, and the ability to control the spread of the Covid-19 virus in Indonesia.

3. RESULTS

Studies on the pandemic management of infectious diseases and migration can be classified into two major school of thoughts. The first thought specified migration variables as dependent variables and pandemic management as independent variables (Rodríguez-Morales et al., 2020). This group builds the following premises: first, the type of infectious diseases pandemic whose epidemiology knowledge structure is still evolving so that no definitive treatment protocol can be established, while vaccines for the treatment of Covid-19 outbreaks are still in the research process (Stein, 2011). Second, the pandemic has the ability to spread rapidly, either from person to person or from animal to person. Third, infectious diseases pandemic causes a very rapid risk of death (Gushulak & MacPherson, 2004).

This group recommends preventive policies by taking some important measures to seriously press the spread of the corona virus. Closing the activity of social interaction is the initial step yet vital to narrow down the opportunity of the corona virus transmission process (Pan et al., 2020). This argument built on the assumption that the viruses has a very limited incubation time. A number of studies have shown the virus's ability to survive in its host averages for 14-28 days. Social restrictions will absolutely make the virus transmission process stopped in a way that the corona virus will naturally die in the end.

The second school of thought identified migration as an independent variable, and pandemic management as dependent variables by using variables between health protocols. This group builds the following premise: First, migration functions as an essential humans' need in a sense that a social being is supposed to interact and perform a number of migrations. Migration has been an inevitable necessity for humans to achieve their productivity in terms of social, economic, political, and cultural needs. Second, humans as intelligent beings have found a comprehensive health protocol that can efficiently manage pandemic issues. Third, it requires individual discipline and awareness for the people who want to travel with the consequence that they have to completely follow health administration obligations, such as being vaccinated, and are in healthy condition (Patel & Jermacane, 2015). Fourth, the sanitation health protocol has already been available in public spaces (Jong & Sanford, 2008). The second group recommends policies to manage pandemics by strengthening health security indexes (Leder et al., 2015) among other things; preserving a healthy lifestyle by regularly maintaining cleanliness, doing vaccination if planning to travel, and

sterilizing public places with the fluid disinfectant. Humans who have had strong immunity are not infected with the virus since it is unable to survive in its incubation period (Gersovitz & Hammer, 2003).

Covid-19 is a disease caused by the new type of coronavirus (2019-nCoV [SARS-COV-2]) (Science, 2020) whose transmission is through person to person. Patients infected with Covid-19 have common symptoms, such as coughing, fever, breathing difficulties, muscle aches, sore throats, loss of sense of smell, diarrhea and headaches. The Corona infected patients' condition can be even worse, causing death (Liu et al., 2020). The manifestation of Covid-19 symptoms apparently indicated new symptoms of which the symptoms of a person infected with the virus become unspecific, creating widespread anxiety among medical personnel. Therefore, continuous updates on Covid-19 with facts basis on the field have ultimately become indispensable (Sun et al., 2020).

The first Covid-19 has initially infected people in Wuhan city, People's Republic of China in the last week of December 2019. Covid-19 cases globally show that a total of 2,197,593 confirmed cases and 153,090 deaths, from 212 countries as of April 18, 2020. In Indonesia, Covid-19 cases of human infection reached 4,241 confirmed cases and a total of 373 death cases in the last 6 weeks from all provinces (34 provinces throughout Indonesia). The spread of cases shows that the highest number of people infected with Covid-19 is in Europe 988,295 cases, followed by America with 826,282 cases, Asia 354,549 cases, Africa 19,897 cases and Oceania 7,874 cases.

There are unique symptoms of Covid-19 that have been evolving, which related to sanitation variables. Countries in Europe are countries with high global security indexes, where America gain the 1st rank and European countries are in 10th place compared to Asia, Oceania, even Africa which is in the top 20 (Nuclear Threat Initiative (NTI) & Johns Hopkins Center for Health Security (JHU), 2019). The pattern is also linear with the number of deaths caused by Covid-19, with European region reaching 95,247 and America reaching 42,751 confirmed death cases.

Table 1. The spread of Covid-19 in the Southeast Asia on September

Country	Cases	Cases Last 24hr	Deaths	Tests	Recovered	Cases per Million	Population
World	26,337,473	272,091	869,331	-	17,545,358	3,377	7,800,000,000
China	89,999	38	4,728	-	84,632	63	1,439,324,000
USA	6,151,253	36,069	186,806	79,816,686	2,266,997	18,584	331,003,000
Indonesia	187,537	3,269	7,832	1,371,391	134,181	700	268,000,000
Philippines	232,072	3,669	3,737	2,739,096	160,543	2,212	104,900,000
Vietnam	1,046	0	35	261,004	772	11	95,540,000
Thailand	3,431	4	58	797,903	3,277	49	69,400,000
Myanmar	1,111	116	6	166,433	359	21	53,370,000
Malaysia	9,385	11	128	1,280,878	9,092	301	31,200,000
Cambodia	274	0	0	12,378	272	17	16,010,000
Laos	22	0	0	40,036	21	3	6,858,000
Singapore	56,948	40	27	2,068,284	56,028	10,148	5,612,000
Brunei	145	0	3	29,841	139	338	428,607

4th, 2020

Source: Southeast Asia Covid-19 Tracker. Retrieved from www.csis.org

What about the infection rate in Indonesia? In January-February 2020, the Indonesian government claimed that there was no Covid-19 infection incidence by any means. Eventually, President Jokowi informed that there were some Indonesians infected with Covid-19 on March 12th, 2020 (Ihsanudin, 2020). The growth of the population infected with Covid-19 tended to be slow and in March the number of Covid-19 infection incidents along with the number of deaths was relatively low and only occurred in several provinces in Java. However, by April 2020, the rate infection was significantly increased, and on 19 April the population infected with Covid-19 had already reached 6,248 total cases, with 535 death cases and 631 recoveries (Data Sebaran, 2020).

This particular circumstance placed Indonesia as the highest rank with infection and death cases due to the Covid-19. Nevertheless, other ASEAN countries like Vietnam, Cambodia and Laos whose territory are geographically nearer to China, as the epicentre of Covid-19, yet their rate of infection and death was at the lowest point and even most of them had 0 case.

On January 30th, 2020 WHO confirmed that Covid-19 has been categorized as a global pandemic, known as a Public Health Emergency of International Concern (PHEIC) in a way that WHO has suggested the world society to temporarily halt travelling or trading. Restriction measures on both air, land and sea have been conducted by China and other countries in order to stop the spreading chain of the contagion. As a result, there needs to have careful coordination efforts among countries being infected so that the implementation of those prevention measures of Covid-19 transmission can be successful.

4. DISCUSSION

Covid-19 pandemic symptoms have initially occurred in November 2019 (Rodríguez-Morales et al., 2020). There was indeed a critical debate among epidemiologists as to whether or not Covid-19 will be classified as a pandemic (Sirkeci & Yucesahin, 2020). This debate apparently influenced the mindset of policy makers in Indonesia to simply respond the Covid-19 phenomenon, which was proven by a number of statements from public officials, such as President, Minister of Health and Minister of Human Development and Culture (Indonesia, 2020a). Indonesia indeed looked at the Covid-19 phenomenon in Wuhan as a great opportunity for increasing the flow of foreign tourists from Eastern Asia to Indonesia. Indonesia even promoted a number of progressive tourism policies in order to attract and provide the opportunity of foreign tourists to come visit tourism objects in Indonesia.

In the period from January-February, promotional measures and travel incentives showed a very satisfactory result, of which there were approximately 1.3 million travellers visiting Indonesia. However, the data successfully made public a little bit worried as the number of tourists travelling to Indonesia were from China. In the last ten years, there has been a trend that Indonesian foreign tourists have commenced to shift their tourism visits preferences, from Europe to East Asia including China, South Korea, and Japan. The number of Chinese tourists coming to Indonesia is supported by China's economic prosperity and the availability of direct flights from China to a number of provinces that are included in Indonesia's flagship tourism destinations.

Indonesia publicly stated that within three months after the pandemic began spreading in Wuhan, no one was found to have infected

Covid-19 in Indonesia. A number of negative statements from other countries in the world, such as the United States of America, Australia and WHO were assertively responded by the government of Indonesia that there is no yet any confirmed cases on positive infection of Covid-19 in Indonesia (Indonesia, 2020c). The policy by which most countries at that time chose to close some flight access from China, as an anticipation step to reduce the spread of Covid-19, was not taken into account by the government of Indonesia. This effort was indicated by Indonesia's attitude in opening more spaces for a number of international tourists coming to Indonesia, even with an incentive policy (Indonesia, 2020b).

In February 2020, tourism visits decreased significantly by 70%, with most tourists coming from China and Australia. Yet the government was still trying to increase tourist visits amid the growing pandemic issue, showing with the efforts to maximizing domestic tourists and foreign tourists from countries not affected by the Covid-19, as well as organizing quality tours with meeting, incentive, convention, and exhibition (MICE) activities. Strategies used to attract visitors were conducted through adding some flight routes, offering lower prices of domestic flights, and implementing regular tourism events. Nonetheless, the government of Indonesia remained conscious that they kept conducting preventive measures by screening with thermo scanners and providing referral places for health facilities (Kompas.com, 2020b).

Table 2. Indonesian minister statement on Covid-19 from January-February 2020

No	Statement of Minister (Indonesia)	Statement in English	Minister
1	Pamer Insentif Pariwisata, Sri Mulyani: Yuk, Kita Pergi!	Showing off tourism incentives, Sri Mulyani: Come on, let's go!	Finance
2	Belum Ada Kasus Corona, Menko PMK: RI Masih Dilindungi Tuhan	No Corona Cases Yet, Coordinating Minister for PMK: RI Still Protected by God	Social Empowering and Culture
3	Wabah Virus Corona jadi Peluang Indonesia Genjot Pariwisata Dalam Negeri	The Corona Virus Outbreak is an Opportunity for Indonesia to Boost Domestic Tourism	Tourism
4	Sebut Corona Tak Kuat Cuaca Indonesia, Luhut Panjaitan Dikritik.	Calling Corona Not Strong Weather Indonesia, Luhut Panjaitan Criticized	Industry and Investation
5	Virus Corona, Wishnutama Geber Insentif Pariwisata Maret	Corona Virus, Wishnutama promote Tourism Incentives in March	Tourism
6	Temui WHO, Wiranto Sebut RI Bebas Corona Bukan Asal Bicara.	Wiranto Called Indonesia, Corona Free, Not Just Talking.	President advisor council

7	Kunjungan Turis China ke RI Naik 1,46% di Tengah Serbuan Corona	Chinese Tourist Visits to Indonesia Rise 1.46% Amid Corona Invasion	Tourism
8	Ancaman Corona: Enjoy Aja	Corona threats: Enjoy it	Health
9	Indonesia berutang pada Tuhan karena Corona tak masuk Indonesia	Indonesia owes God a debt because Corona did not enter Indonesia	Health
10	Virus Corona: Jangan dibesar-besarkan	Corono Virus: Don't be exaggerated	Industry and Investment

Source: Ini Daftar 37 Pernyataan Blunder Pemerintah Soal Corona Versi LP3ES. Retrieved from news.detik.com

In the period from January to the end of February 2020, the Indonesian government had not yet announced Covid-19 pandemic as a national crisis. Even they regarded this pandemic as an opportunity for accelerating the development of the tourism sector instead of a threat. The Indonesian government believed that herd immunity, natural immunity and tropical weather were deemed as Indonesia's embedded strength in dealing with the pandemic. Accordingly, Indonesia assumed that this particular situation would highly benefit them since most of the countries had already limited their people's mobility. Not to mention, the development of tourism sector at that time was under serious pressure due to the strengthening of dollar exchange rate over rupiah which had an impact on the increase in airfares. When dollar exchange rate began to stabilise at 14,000 rupiah, the government noticed the need to mobilize tourism sector to boost Indonesia's economic growth (WartaEkonomi.co.id, 2020). On the other hand, some Chinese who feel the fear of the Covid-19 outbreak mostly chose to travel abroad to stay away from the Covid-19 outbreak. And Indonesia became the most strategic and possible place to visit since China's flight to a number of Indonesian airports is in a direct flight position. Moreover, the cost of living in Indonesia is also relatively competitive, in which it successfully implied on the increasing number of tourists from China in January by 1.4% compared to the previous year (Detik.com, 2020b).

The statement focusing on the importance of mobility of people and goods in the pandemic era was more expressed by the Ministry of Investment, Industry and Tourism. The Ministry of Industry stated that the symptoms of Covid-19 infectious disease should not be exaggerated as it implied on damaging the investment and tourism climate (TribuneNews.com, 2020). In line with the Ministry of Industry, the

Ministry of Investment also released an official statement that Covid-19 will not definitely be able to survive in Indonesia since Indonesia has a very hot climate which could neutralize the virus. Accordingly, the investment activity ought to continue at all cost (SindoNews.com, 2020). The Ministry of Tourism also created a policy to keep tourism running by providing incentives for transportation, as the most high-priced component, that could attract tourists to visit tourism destinations in Indonesia (Tempo.co.id, 2020). The Ministry of Health whose domain is in the prevention of infectious diseases, unfortunately also published similar policies to the public. It says that the Covid-19 phenomenon should be deemed as common place. There is no need to worry as the data shows the number of death cases caused by Covid-19 is relatively low, so the public anxiety towards the pandemic issue should not be exaggerated. With the Indonesia's abundant natural resources, the Indonesian society should not worry as those resources were deemed as materials that can effectively work to boost their bodies' immunity. Though the Ministry of Health's statement gained a lot of harsh criticism and challenges from a number of health and infectious disease experts, their policy had not much changed and they kept ignoring it (Suara.com, 2020). The LP3ES think tank even published that there are approximately 39 counter-productive Indonesian ministerial policies related to the management of the Covid-19 pandemic in Indonesia (Detik.com, 2020a).

However, with the increasingly uncontrolled spread of Covid-19 related to import cases on March 2nd, 2020, President Jokowi publicly stated that Indonesia has confirmed the spread of Covid-19 in Jakarta province, and subsequently spread to in a number of provinces rapidly. In two months later, the growth of people infected with Covid-19 had been causing 5 people confirmed positive Corona virus, which impacted on labelling Indonesia as one of the most infected country in the world. Yet the most fatal occurrence to notice was that the percentage of deaths and recoveries in Indonesia was apparently the worst compared to countries in Southeast Asia.

The policy of crossing to and from Indonesia related to the Covid-19 pandemic was implemented on March 20th, 2020 with the purpose to minimize imported cases from abroad to Indonesia. The policy included restrictions on Indonesian citizens traveling abroad, encouraging them to return to Indonesia immediately. It further comprised visa-free

postponement and an obligation to attach a Healthy Certificate, as well as a 14-day quarantine held by the government of Indonesia. The quarantine program specifically pointed out towards Indonesian citizens within the last 14 days visiting Iran, Italy, Vatican, Spain, France, Germany, Switzerland and the United Kingdom in which they ought to be initially checked at the port health office before departing back to their homes respectively (RMOL.id, 2020). Meanwhile, migrants had to hand in a Health Alert Card before arriving at the Indonesian airports. Accordingly, for all Indonesian citizens who had an initial-symptoms needed to be observed for 14 days in health facilities and if not, they should conduct a self-quarantine for 14 days.

Table 3. Indonesian minister statement on Covid-19 during March 2020

No	Statement of Minister (Indonesia)	Statement in English	Minister
1	<i>Mulai 8 Maret Indonesia Larang Masuk Pemandang Iran, Italia, Dan Korsel, Kecuali Dengan Surat Keterangan Sehat.</i>	Starting March 8, Indonesia will prohibit entry to Iran, Italy and South Korea, except with a health certificate.	Foreign affairs
2	<i>Strategi Pemerintah Tingkatkan Pariwisata yang Terdampak Wabah Virus Corona.</i>	Government's Strategy to Increase Tourism Affected by the Corona Virus Outbreak.	Tourism
3	<i>Satgas COVID-19: Kasus Meningkat Cukup Signifikan, Kondisi Mengkhawatirkan</i>	Task Force COVID-19: Cases Increase Significantly, Worrying Conditions	Covid19 Taskforce

Source: Ini Daftar 37 Pernyataan Blunder Pemerintah Soal Corona Versi LP3ES. Retrieved from news.detik.com

Based on the aforementioned portrayal, there was a significant difference of policies conducted by the government of Indonesia, before March and during March 2020; Before March the government of Indonesia applied a very progressive behaviour by enthusiastically capturing opportunities on attracting foreign tourists as much as possible in order to accelerate the economic growth. However, since day one of March the policy had dramatically changed into a very conservative way in a sense that some access to international and domestic tourisms were restricted. International and domestic services were also massively closed. Even services in each and every single hotel applied a very strict

policy of which it emphasized on the service of self-isolation. Foreign tourists who insist to travel should follow health protocols in the form of conducting self-service for 14 days before being allowed to make a tourist visit. As a result, many tourist destinations, from March to June 2020, had been strictly closed.

The conservative standpoint with its 'lockdown' policy caused a number of tourism-supporting infrastructure experiencing a tremendous economic contraction (Susilawati et al., 2020). The air, sea, and land transportation businesses experienced a huge drop in revenue, so a number of transportation companies applied policies on instructing their employees work from home. Even other transportation companies conducted the termination of contract towards their own employees. In addition, due to the huge falling of hotel rates, the hotel business had been also experiencing an extraordinary contraction as the cost of day-to-day hotel maintenance could not be covered by the amount of revenue gained. Accordingly, the number of employees working in hotels had been enormously reduced because of the Covid-19 pandemic. A number of hotels in Bali could not survive and was even on sale since the economic rate of hotel business was getting worse and declining. Besides, the implementation of social distancing policies also caused a strong economic contraction, in which many restaurants had to suffer huge losses as the policy banned foreign tourists and people gathering in public places, including restaurants.

The conservative policies which restricted migration and travelling, unfortunately did not get an adequate attention. As the consequence, the speed of Covid-19 virus spread did not seem reducing and even increasing which considerably caused many people infected with the novel corona virus, with 184,268 total confirmed cases on September 3th, 2020, which made the society more paranoid (Detik.com, 2020c). On the other hand, Indonesia also experienced a significant economic downturn as Indonesia's economic growth enormously dropped to -5% in July 2020 and reached the brink of economic recession (Kompas.com, 2020a). The exacerbation of economic condition and the increasing spread of Covid-19 in Indonesia have subsequently been identified as one of consequential risks of applying this particular Zig Zag's policy, as a response to the pandemic.

5. CONCLUSION

Within Indonesian context, two schools of thoughts both conservative and progressive applied as the strategies to stop the chain of infectious diseases and to support the economic growth have ultimately turned into the most trending discourses in the public and government discussion. However, in the context of undiscovered vaccines, discourses on the prevention of infectious diseases in a discipline way have been indicated as the top-priority agenda and mostly chosen by most countries globally. The decline in economic growth is then a consequential risk that will last for a limited period of time as the compensation for the efficient management of cutting the spreading chain of infectious diseases.

The discourse developed by the government of Indonesia adopted more arguments derived from the progressive group, that Indonesian societies have sort of unique immunity that could neutralize the Covid-19 spreading process. The implementation of health protocols and restrictions on social activities is also claimed to be efficient way to contain the contagion. The core reason why the Indonesian government preferred a policy which still allows several migration activities, both domestic and international, is to assure the running wheels of social, economic, political and cultural life in the society. However, the protesters remained arguing that conservative policy is a bad decision which might further exacerbate Indonesia's resilience capacity in effectively managing the spread of Covid-19 pandemic in the upcoming months.

REFERENCES

- BPSI. (2018). *Jumlah kunjungan wisman ke Indonesia Agustus 2018 mencapai 1,51 juta kunjungan*. 10 Oktober 2018. Retrieved from <https://www.bps.go.id/pressrelease/2018/10/01/1476/jumlah-kunjungan-wisman-ke-indonesia-agustus-2018-mencapai-1-51-juta-kunjungan-.html#:~:text=Jumlah%20kunjungan%20wisatawan%20mancanegara%20atau,menjadi%201%2C51%20juta%20kunjungan>.
- Chandra Roy, S., & Roy, M. (2015). Tourism in Bangladesh: Present Status and Future Prospects. *The International Journal of Management Science and Business Administration*, 1(8), 53–61. <https://doi.org/10.18775/ijmsba.1849-5664-5419.2014.18.1006>
- Cheng, K. M. (2012). Tourism demand in Hong Kong: Income, prices, and visa restrictions. *Current Issues in Tourism*, 15(3), 167–181. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13683500.2011.569011>
- CNN. (2020). *World's 10 most popular tourist destinations (and their future rivals)*. Retrieved from <https://edition.cnn.com/travel/article/world-most-popular-destinations-2017/index.html>
- CNNIndonesia.com. (2020). *Jokowi Ikhlas “Bakar Duit” Promosi Wisata Indonesia*. Retrieved from <https://www.cnnindonesia.com/ekonomi/20191115180053-92-448807/jokowi-ikhlas-bakar-duit-promosi-wisata-indonesia>
- Data Sebaran. (2020). *Gugus Tugas Penanganan Covid Secara Cepat*. <https://www.covid19.go.id>
- Detik.com. (2020a). *Ini Daftar 37 Pernyataan Blunder Pemerintah Soal Corona Versi LP3ES*. Retrieved from <https://news.detik.com/berita/d-4967416/ini-daftar-37-pernyataan-blunder-pemerintah-soal-corona-versi-lp3es>
- Detik.com. (2020b). *Kunjungan Turis China ke RI Naik 1,46% di Tengah Serbuan Corona*. Retrieved from <https://finance.detik.com/berita->

ekonomi-bisnis/d-4921790/kunjungan-turis-china-ke-ri-naik-146-di-tengah-serbuan-corona

- Detik.com. (2020c). *Satgas COVID-19: Kasus Meningkatkan Cukup Signifikan, Kondisi Mengkhawatirkan*. Retrieved from <https://news.detik.com/berita/d-5158550/satgas-covid-19-kasus-meningkat-cukup-signifikan-kondisi-mengkhawatirkan>
- Ergas, Y., & Felsenstein, D. (2012). Airport relocation and expansion and the estimation of derived tourist demand: The case of Eilat, Israel. *Journal of Air Transport Management*, 24, 54–61. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jairtraman.2012.06.005>
- Erislan. (2016). Tourist Attraction and the Uniqueness of Resources on Tourist Destination in West Java, Indonesia. *Review of Integrative Business & Economics Research*. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3150481>
- Fernández, X. L., Coto-Millán, P., & Díaz-Medina, B. (2018). The impact of tourism on airport efficiency: The Spanish case. *Utilities Policy*, 55, 52–58. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jup.2018.09.002>
- Gersovitz, M., & Hammer, J. S. (2003). Infectious diseases, public policy and the marriage of economics and epidemiology. *World Bank Research Observer*, 18(2), 129–157. <https://doi.org/10.1093/wbro/lkg011>
- Gushulak, B. D., & MacPherson, D. W. (2004). Globalization of Infectious Diseases: The Impact of Migration. *Clinical Infectious Diseases*, 38(12), 1742–1748. <https://doi.org/10.1086/421268>
- Hampton, M. P., & Clifton, J. (2016). Tourism in Indonesia. In *The Routledge Handbook of Tourism in Asia*. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315768250>
- Hanifah, R. D. (2019). The Influence of Instagram Travel Influencer on Visiting Decision of Tourist Destinations for Generation. *Tourism Proceeding*.

- Ihsanudin. (2020). *Pengumuman Mendadak Jokowi yang Kejutkan Pasien Positif Corona*. Kompas.Com. Retrieved from <https://nasional.kompas.com/read/2020/03/04/08051361/pengumuman-mendadak-jokowi-yang-kejutkan-pasien-positif-corona>
- Indonesia, C. (2020a). *Belum Ada Kasus Corona, Menko PMK: RI Masih Dilindungi Tuhan*. Retrieved from <https://www.cnbcindonesia.com/news/20200217130044-4-138357/belum-ada-kasus-corona-menko-pmk-ri-masih-dilindungi-tuhan>
- Indonesia, C. (2020b). *Pamer Insentif Pariwisata, Sri Mulyani: Yuk, Kita Pergi!* Retrieved from <https://www.cnbcindonesia.com/news/20200226110921-4-140517/pamer-insentif-pariwisata-sri-mulyani-yuk-kita-pergi>
- Indonesia, C. (2020c). *Temui WHO, Wiranto Sebut RI Bebas Corona Bukan Asal Bicara*. Retrieved from <https://www.cnbcindonesia.com/news/20200217143405-4-138398/temui-who-wiranto-sebut-ri-bebas-corona-bukan-asal-bicara>
- Jong, E. C., & Sanford, C. (2008). The Travel and Tropical Medicine Manual. *The Travel and Tropical Medicine Manual*. <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-1-4160-2613-6.X0050-X>
- Khadaroo, J., & Seetanah, B. (2007). Transport infrastructure and tourism development. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 34(4), 1021–1032. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annals.2007.05.010>
- Kompas.com. (2020a). *Indonesia di Ambang Resesi, Apa Dampaknya pada Masyarakat?* Retrieved from <https://www.kompas.com/tren/read/2020/09/04/071000865/indonesia-di-ambang-resesi-apa-dampaknya-pada-masyarakat-?page=all#:~:text=Penurunan%20pasokan%20atau%20supply%20tersebut,meningkatnya%20angka%20pengangguran%20dan%20kemiskinan.>
- Kompas.com. (2020b). *Strategi Pemerintah Tingkatkan Pariwisata yang Terdampak Wabah Virus Corona*. Retrieved from <https://nasional.kompas.com/read/2020/02/07/07505111/strategi-pemerintah-tingkatkan-pariwisata-yang-terdampak-wabah-virus-corona?page=all>
- Leder, K., Steffen, R., Cramer, J. P., & Greenaway, C. (2015). Risk

- assessment in travel medicine: How to obtain, interpret, and use risk data for informing pre-travel advice. *Journal of Travel Medicine*, 22(1), 13–20. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jtm.12170>
- Liu, Y., Sun, W., Li, J., Chen, L., Wang, Y., Zhang, L., & Yu, L. (2020). Clinical features and progression of acute respiratory distress syndrome in coronavirus disease 2019. *MedRxiv*. <https://doi.org/10.1101/2020.02.17.20024166>
- Maarif, N. (2019). *Pariwisata Sudah Sumbang US\$ 19,29 Miliar untuk Devisa Indonesia*. Detik Travel. Retrieved from <https://travel.detik.com/travel-news/d-4669424/pariwisata-sudah-sumbang-us-1929-miliar-untuk-devisa-indonesia>
- Mahadevan, R., Amir, H., & Nugroho, A. (2017). Regional impacts of tourism-led growth on poverty and income: Inequality: A dynamic general equilibrium analysis for Indonesia. *Tourism Economics*, 23(3), 614–631. <https://doi.org/10.5367/te.2015.0534>
- Mawardi, Isal. (2020, April 06). Ini Daftar 37 Pernyataan Blunder Pemerintah Soal Corona Versi LP3ES. *Detik.com*. Retrieved from <https://news.detik.com/berita/d-4967416/ini-daftar-37-pernyataan-blunder-pemerintah-soal-corona-versi-lp3es>
- Nizar, M. A. (2015). Tourism Effect on Economic Growth in Indonesia. *Munich Personal RePEc Archive (MPRA)*.
- Nuclear Threat Initiative (NTI), & Johns Hopkins Center for Health Security (JHU). (2019). *Global Health Security Index: Building Collective Action and Accountability*. Retrieved from <https://www.ghsindex.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/10/2019-Global-Health-Security-Index.pdf>
- Pan, X., Ojcius, D. M., Gao, T., Li, Z., Pan, C., & Pan, C. (2020). Lessons learned from the 2019-nCoV epidemic on prevention of future infectious diseases. *Microbes and Infection*, 22(2), 86-91. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.micinf.2020.02.004>
- Patel, D., & Jermacane, D. (2015). Social media in travel medicine: A review. In *Travel Medicine and Infectious Disease*, 13(2), 135–142. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmaid.2015.03.006>
- Pidato Kenegaraan Presiden Jokowi Di Sidang Tahunan MPR Tahun 2019*. (2019). Kantor Staf Presiden. Retrieved from <http://ksp.go.id/pidato-kenegaraan-presiden-jokowi-di-sidan-tahunan-mpr-2019/>
- RMOL.id. (2020). *Mulai 8 Maret Indonesia Larang Masuk Pendetang*

- Iran, Italia, Dan Korsel, Kecuali Dengan Surat Keterangan Sehat*. Retrieved from <https://kesehatan.rmol.id/read/2020/03/05/424117/mulai-8-maret-indonesia-larang-masuk-pendatang-iran-italia-dan-korsel-kecuali-dengan-surat-keterangan-sehat>
- Rodríguez-Morales, A. J., MacGregor, K., Kanagarajah, S., Patel, D., & Schlegelhauf, P. (2020). Going global – Travel and the 2019 novel coronavirus. In *Travel Medicine and Infectious Disease*, 33, 101578. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmaid.2020.101578>
- Science. (2020). Coronavirus latest: WHO officially names disease COVID-19. *Science*. Retrieved from <https://www.scienceboard.net/index.aspx?sec=sup&sub=can&pag=dis&ItemID=491>
- SindoNews.com. (2020). *Sebut Corona Tak Kuat Cuaca Indonesia, Luhut Panjaitan Dikritik*. Retrieved from <https://nasional.sindonews.com/berita/1578667/15/sebut-corona-tak-kuat-cuaca-indonesia-luhut-panjaitan-dikritik>
- Sirkeci, I., & Yucesahin, M. M. (2020). Coronavirus and Migration: Analysis of Human Mobility and the Spread of Covid-19. *Migration Letters*, 17(2), 379–398. <https://doi.org/10.33182/ml.v17i2.935>
- Stein, R. A. (2011). Super-spreaders in infectious diseases. In *International Journal of Infectious Diseases*, 15(8), e510–e513. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijid.2010.06.020>
- Suara.com. (2020). *Komunikasi Menkes Terawan Dikritik, 4 Pernyataan Soal Corona Jadi Sorotan*. Retrieved from <https://www.suara.com/news/2020/03/04/101853/komunikasi-menkes-terawan-dikritik-4-pernyataan-soal-corona-jadi-sorotan?page=all>
- Sugiyarto, G., Blake, A., & Sinclair, M. T. (2003). Tourism and globalization: Economic Impact in Indonesia. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 30(3), 683–701. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0160-7383\(03\)00048-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0160-7383(03)00048-3)
- Sun, P., Lu, X., Xu, C., Sun, W., & Pan, B. (2020). Understanding of COVID-19 based on current evidence. *Journal of Medical Virology*, 92(6), 548–551. <https://doi.org/10.1002/jmv.25722>
- Susilawati, S., Falefi, R., & Purwoko, A. (2020). Impact of COVID-19's Pandemic on the Economy of Indonesia. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute (BIRCI-Journal): Humanities and Social Sciences*, 3(2), 1147–1156.

- <https://doi.org/10.33258/birci.v3i2.954>
 Tempo.co.id. (2020). *Virus Corona, Wishnutama Geber Insentif Pariwisata Maret*. Retrieved from <https://bisnis.tempo.co/read/1313587/virus-corona-wishnutama-geber-insentif-pariwisata-maret>
- The Jakarta Post. (2017). Indonesia announces 10 new destination brands. *Business*. Retrieved from <https://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2017/06/15/indonesia-announces-10-new-destination-brands.html#:~:text=The%2010%20destinations%20are%20Bandung,most%20prepared%20to%20receive%20tourists.>
- TribuneNews.com. (2020). *Menperin Soal Virus Corona: Jangan Dibesar-besarkan*. Retrieved from <https://www.tribunnews.com/bisnis/2020/01/29/menperin-soal-virus-corona-jangan-dibesar-besarkan>
- UNWTO. (2018). *UNWTO Tourism Highlights. International Tourism Trends 2017*. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.18111/9789284419876>
- Uzama, A. (2009). Marketing Japan's travel and tourism industry to international tourists. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, 21(3), 356–365. <https://doi.org/10.1108/09596110910948341>
- WartaEkonomi.co.id. (2020). *Wabah Virus Corona jadi Peluang Indonesia Genjot Pariwisata Dalam Negeri*. Retrieved from <https://www.wartaekonomi.co.id/read274500/wabah-virus-corona-jadi-peluang-indonesia-genjot-pariwisata-dalam-negeri>
- Wattanacharoensil, W., Schuckert, M., Graham, A., & Dean, A. (2017). An analysis of the airport experience from an air traveler perspective. *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management*, 32, 124–135. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jhtm.2017.06.003>
- Webster, C. (2017). Tourism and Development Concepts and Issues. *Journal of Tourism Futures*, 3(2), 194–195. <https://doi.org/10.1108/jtf-09-2017-066>
- World Travel & Tourism Council. (2017). Travel & Tourism Economic Impact 2017: Indonesia. *World Travel & Tourism Council*.